



Academic Program Review
Data Resources and Template

Office of Academic Affairs

Office of Institutional Effectiveness and Analytics

Borough of Manhattan Community College

August 20, 2019

The sections from the *Narrative Guidelines* are broken out in the same way as below. However, this template provides guidance specifically related to the data; what is needed, how it addresses each section, and how the data can be interpreted and conveyed clearly.

Please note: Disaggregation of data by race/ethnicity and gender is only appropriate for larger programs where there are sufficient numbers to make this a meaningful summary.

1. Overview of the Program:
 - How the program aligns with BMCC's strategic outcomes
 - Department/program mission statement
 - Department goals
 - Program learning outcomes for the degree program or department
 - Identification of General Education Program outcomes addressed by the program under review
2. Enrollment, Retention, and Graduation Rates:
 - Overall assessment of the enrollment of students in the major each fall.
 - See **Resource 1. Enrollment, Retention, and Completion Report (also on the website)**.
 - Enrollment by Major, p. 5.
 - See **DASHBOARDS** on https://www.bmcc.cuny.edu/iea/fact_stat.jsp
 - <https://public.tableau.com/profile/bmcc.oiea#!/vizhome/FactbookEnrollmentDashboard/EnrollmentbyTerm> (Use Degree Program Tab)

Questions to ask: Is our enrollment adequate? Has it been increasing or decreasing? Are we offering an appropriate number of sections for key courses for our majors?

- Analysis of longitudinal enrollment, one-year retention, and three-year graduation rates, disaggregated by race/ethnicity and gender for largest majors, and for the college overall.
 - See **Resource 1. Enrollment, Retention, and Completion Report (also on the website)**.
 - One-Year Retention by Major, p. 12.
 - Retention by Gender and Ethnicity, p. 10, 13.
 - Two-Year Retention by Major, p. 14, 17-19.

- Three-Year Graduation Rates: Gender and Ethnicity, p. 21.
- Three-Year Graduation Rates by Major, p. 22.
- Degrees Awarded by Major, p. 23.
- See **DASHBOARDS** on https://www.bmcc.cuny.edu/iea/fact_stat.jsp
- See **Resource 5: APR Cohorts Packaged Dashboard** following cohorts 1, 3, and 4 years after starting as new freshmen at BMCC. (See also **BMCC New Student Cohorts** on the web site)

Questions to ask: Are we keeping our majors at BMCC? Are we losing a significant number to other majors? Do we tend to attract continuing students from Liberal Arts or other majors? Do our majors graduate on time? How long do our graduates take to earn their degree? Do we see any inequity in retention and graduation within our major? Is the enrollment in our major too low to assess equity? Are there any years when our incoming cohort of new freshmen was unusually large or small? Can you link changes in enrollment or outcomes to policy or other changes in your department? Does your graduation rate increase substantially or only incrementally between 3 and 4 years after initial enrollment? If so, are there possible impediments to an on-time graduation in your program requirements?

- Analysis of pass rates in gateway courses in the major, disaggregated by race, ethnicity, and gender as appropriate.
 - See **Resource 2. Equity and Course Outcomes by Department**. This report provides disaggregated data on the top enrollment course of each department.
 - See **Resource 3. Course Outcomes (PACKAGED DASHBORD)**. In this dashboard, by selecting your department and the years and semesters of interest, you can view the historic official and valid pass rates and DFWI rates for all your courses. For any course where enrollment in a given semester is > 1000 you can also see a breakdown of the data by race/ethnicity and gender.

Questions to ask: Are there any equity issues in the largest course in your department? Is this course required for this major? What other courses in the department are required for this major and have low pass rates (High DFWI rates)? Which other courses taken by your majors are they least likely to pass? Have you taken any steps to address any issues with courses and low pass rates? Note: If numbers are large, the Course Outcomes dashboard will allow you to filter the data for specific years: for example: years before and after a policy change.

- **Resource 4. Top 25 Courses by Major**. Includes the 25 top courses taken by your major in recent terms, showing Enrollment Totals and DFWI rates. This information is part of the Course Outcomes dashboard.

- Analysis of longitudinal credit accumulation in first four semesters, disaggregated by race, ethnicity, and gender for largest majors and for college overall.
 - For analysis of credit accumulation without disaggregation, See **Resource 1. [Enrollment, Retention, and Completion Report \(also on the website\).](#)**
 - Sophomore Standing by Second Year, by Major, p. 15.
 - Average Credit Accumulation in First Year, by Major, p. 27.
 - Average Credit Accumulation by Second Year (for those retained), by Major, p. 28.
 - For a deeper dive, the APR Cohorts Dashboard shows all of the cohort, with the % earning 30 credits (Sophomore Standing) in the first year and groups the entire cohort (not just those retained) according to the number of credits they have earned in two years. This can also be broken down by either Gender or Ethnicity.

Questions to ask: Do you see improvement in the % of full-time students earning 30 credits in their first year? Can you tie this to any initiatives in your department? Are there still a large number of students with null or 0 credits after two years? Have most of these students left the college or are they still in developmental classes? Are there any equity issues that emerge that may prevent some students from making better progress?

- Description of recruitment strategies
 - Plans and strategies to increase enrollment (if appropriate)
 - Description of strategies to improve retention and graduation rates, including how to reduce any equity gaps by race/ethnicity, and gender
3. Transfer and Post-Graduation Outcomes:
- Transfer rates after graduation to CUNY 4-year colleges, disaggregated by race, ethnicity, and gender when numbers are sufficient.
 - See **Resource 1: [Enrollment, Retention, and Completion Report \(also on the website\).](#)**
 - Transfer Rates to CUNY Baccalaureate Programs by BMCC Degree Major, p. 24.
 - General transfers to non-CUNY Colleges, p. 26.
 - See **Resource 6: [BMCC Graduates and Transfers DASHBOARD \(on the website\).](#)**

- Breakdown of graduates in major by gender (Graduates by Degree Title tab)
- CUNY Transfers by Degree Program tab: select your major to view transfer rates over time and with aggregated GPA for your majors in their first term at another CUNY.
- CUNY Transfers by College tab: Select the CUNY colleges where your majors have transferred and then select your major to see the majors they were enrolled in when they transferred to that college.
- Under Ethnicity tab, see transfer rates for largest majors disaggregated by race/ethnicity.

Questions to ask: Is the transfer rate as high as you expect it to be? Does the average GPA for your graduates show an acceptable level of preparation?

- Transfer-out (before graduation) rates within CUNY.
- See **Resource 5: APR Cohorts Packaged Dashboard** following cohorts 1, 3, and 4 years after starting as new freshmen at BMCC.

Questions to ask: Are you losing a substantial portion of your entering new freshmen cohort at the end of the first year?

- Identification of top 3-5 transfer institutions and GPA of BMCC students in these institutions and all existing articulation agreements
 - See **Resource 6: [BMCC Graduates and Transfers DASHBOARD \(on the website\)](#)**. Under CUNY transfers by Degree Program tab, select your Degree program from the drop tab. Make sure to view the Dashboard in full screen.
 - See also **Resource 1. [Enrollment, Retention, and Completion Report \(on the website\)](#)**.

Questions to ask: Are your majors attending schools where you have articulation agreements? Are they selecting majors related to their BMCC major?

- Six-year baccalaureate rates for transfer students, disaggregated by race/ethnicity, and gender, where numbers are sufficient.
 - See **Resource 7: BA Attainment Rate 4 & 6 Years after BMCC Graduation (for Transfers)**. Includes attached table showing transfer numbers and numbers for largest majors earning BA degree in 4 or 6 years after graduation at BMCC, broken down by race/ethnicity categories where possible. **Note: Six year rates are valid for 2010 and 2011 graduating cohorts.**

Questions to ask: Are the students who transfer completing their degrees? If your major is large, do you see any disparity by gender or ethnicity?

- Analysis of labor market data for graduates
 - See **Resource 8: Labor Market Data by Meta Major**. This report is intended to be a general indication of the labor market for students in majors similar to yours in the New York metropolitan area. IEA will provide data on top employers, commonly held job titles and skills demanded as well as average salaries information.
 - **Resource 9: Graduate New York State Employment Data**

Questions to ask: If your major is career-focused, are the students entering the career fields you expect? What does the labor market look like for your graduates? Is there a demand in the labor market for the skills they learn in your major? Are you missing any opportunities to guide students into available careers?

- **G:\0-DATA\APR**
 - Description of strategies to improve transfer rates and post-graduation outcomes, including strategies to work with top transfer institutions to improve student outcomes by institution
4. Curriculum:
- A program map illustrating preferred course sequencing to complete all degree requirements in four semesters for students without developmental needs and a program map to complete all degree requirements in six semesters for students with developmental needs, including specific math courses/pathways for majors.
 - Rationale for course sequencing
 - Mapping of course learning outcomes with student learning outcomes for degree

- Strategies for maintaining consistent standards across multiple sections
- Evidence of responsiveness to changes in the field, including role of advisory board (if applicable)
- Description of any recent or planned curricular changes
- Review of the appropriateness and measurability of course student learning outcomes and program learning outcomes.
- Description of strategies to prepare students for fulfilling careers with family-sustaining wages

5. Instruction and Scholarship:

- List of all full-time faculty with rank, tenure status, date of hire, degrees
- Faculty development priorities and strategies to improve pedagogy
- Strategies for supporting new FT and PT faculty
- Full-time/part-time faculty ratios for required courses in major and high enrollment courses
- Enrollment and pass rates in hybrid or fully online courses offered in past three years
 - See **Resource 3: Course Outcomes PACKAGED DASHBOARD** (e-Learning Tab). Also Excel Extracts file.
- Strategies for increasing hybrid and fully online offerings
- Number of sections and enrollment in winter and summer sessions over the past three years and strategies to encourage students to enroll in winter and summer to maintain momentum
 - See **Resource 3: Course Outcomes PACKAGED DASHBOARD**. Select summer and winter sessions for your Department. Also Excel Extracts file.

6. Assessment of Student Learning Outcomes:

- Program assessment plan
- Discussion of the assessment plan for the program including alignment of BMCC general education assessment to program-level assessment
- Description of recent assessment efforts, including of general education outcomes
- Description of regular assessment process designed to ensure continuous improvement of program

- Description of how assessment results have been used for course-level or program redesign and/or improvement, and the results of those changes
7. Student Satisfaction with the Program:
- Analysis of faculty role in student mentoring and advisement
 - Summary of findings from student focus groups including alumni feedback.
 - To be provided by IEA after the focus groups take place.
 - Strategies to improve student engagement inside and outside the classroom
 - Strategies to improve alumni engagement
8. Adequacy of Resources:
- Analyze the use and adequacy of resources to support the program, including but not limited to the following:
 - Budget allocation
 - Facilities, including labs, offices, and equipment
 - Library resources
 - Student support services
 - Administrative support
 - Support from other College offices/services
9. Analysis of Program Strengths and Weaknesses:
- Assessment of strengths and weaknesses of the program, including how it is intentionally designed for student success
 - Description of any specific concerns and/or any threats to the program
 - Description of any opportunities to grow or improve the visibility of the program.
 - Description of any special accomplishments and/or external recognition for the program, faculty, or for recent graduates
10. Recommendations and Priorities for Program Improvement: Action Plan
- List of specific actions that will lead to improved student success and the enhancement of overall program quality based on this program review

- **Resource 1: Enrollment Retention and Completion Report PDF** (also on website)
- **Resource 2: Equity and Course Outcomes by Department PDF**
- **Resource 3: Course Outcomes DASHBOARD** (e-learning, and Summer and Winter Course offering extracts).
- **Resource 4: Top 25 Courses by Major PDF** (extract from Course Outcomes Dashboard)
- **Resource 5: APR Cohorts DASHBOARD** (see also BMCC New Student Cohorts on website)
- **Resource 6: BMCC Graduates and Transfers DASHBOARD** (on website)
- **Resource 7: BA Attainment Rate 4 & 6 Years after BMCC Graduation**
- **Resource 8: Labor Market Data by Meta Major PDF**
- **Resource 9: Graduate New York State Employment Data PDF**

Summary of findings from student focus groups (After focus groups are held.)

Upon Request: For faculty identified by department major: Summary or listing of faculty scholarship works as reported each year to CUNY. (2010-2017)

Individualized Items:

- Resource 9 (Graduate New York State Employment Data) for each program/department
- E-learning Extracts from Course Outcomes Dashboard (Resource 3)
- Summer and Winter Course Offerings (Resource 3)
- Resource 4 (Top 25 Courses by Major) Excel extract from Course Outcomes Dashboard

Additional Data Provided by IEA:

- Longitudinal enrollment, one-year retention, and three-year graduation rates, disaggregated by race, ethnicity, and gender
 - See IEA Resource 1: [Enrollment, Retention, and Completion Report \(on the website\)](#).
- Pass rates in gateway courses in the major

See IEA Resource 2: Equity and Course Outcomes by Department, Spring 2018.

If the course in your department is not included in the major being studied for the APR, use English 101, required for all majors. Additional courses where enrollment in a given semester is > 1000 can also be broken down using IEA Resource 3-: **Course Outcomes DASHBOARD** (e.g., MAT 56 which may be required for your major.)

See IEA Resource 4: Top 25 Courses by Major

Attached graphic and table include the 25 top courses taken by your major in recent terms, showing Enrollment Totals and DFWI rates. Additional drill-down to more courses or by term can be found in IEA Resource 3: **Course Outcomes DASHBOARD**

- Longitudinal credit accumulation in first four semesters, disaggregated by race, ethnicity, and gender
 - See IEA Resource 1: [Enrollment, Retention, and Completion Report \(on the website\)](#).
 - Sophomore Standing by Second Year, by Major, p. 15.
 - Average Credit Accumulation in First Year, by Major, p. 27.
 - Average Credit Accumulation by Second Year (for those retained), by Major, p. 28.
- Longitudinal transfer rates before and after graduation, in CUNY and outside of CUNY, disaggregated by race, ethnicity, and gender
 - See IEA Resource 1: [Enrollment, Retention, and Completion Report \(on the website\)](#).
- Identification of top 3-5 transfer institutions and GPA of BMCC students in these institutions
 - See IEA Resource 1: [Enrollment, Retention, and Completion Report \(on the website\)](#).
 - Transfer Rates to CUNY Baccalaureate Programs by BMCC Degree Major, p. 24.

See IEA Resource 7: BA Attainment Rate 4 & 6 Years after BMCC Graduation and [BMCC Graduates and Transfers DASHBOARD](#).

- Six-year baccalaureate rates for transfer students, disaggregated by race, ethnicity, and gender
See IEA Resource 7: BA Attainment Rate 4 & 6 Years after BMCC Graduation and [BMCC Graduates and Transfers DASHBOARD](#).

- Labor market data for graduates

See IEA Resource 8: Labor Market Data by Meta Major

Note: This report is intended to be a general indication of the labor market for students in majors similar to yours in the New York metropolitan area

See also IEA Resource 9: Graduate New York State Employment Data by Major

- Enrollment and pass rates in hybrid or fully online courses offered in past three years
See IEA Resource 3: Course Outcomes-e-learning
See also: **Course Outcomes DASHBOARD** (e-Learning Tab).
- Number of sections and enrollment in winter and summer sessions over the past three years.
See IEA Resource 3: Summer and Winter Course offerings.
See also: **Course Outcomes DASHBOARD** (Select summer and winter sessions for your Department.)
- Summary of findings from student focus groups
(After focus groups are held.)

Upon Request: For faculty identified by department major: Summary or listing of faculty scholarship works as reported each year to CUNY. (2010-2017)